

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

STATE FARM MUTUAL AUTOMOBILE
INSURANCE COMPANY and STATE FARM
FIRE AND CASUALTY COMPANY,

Plaintiffs,

v.

METROPOLITAN FAMILY PRACTICE,
METROPOLITAN HEALTHCARE CENTER,
INC., D/B/A AS METROPOLITAN
HEALTHCARE CENTER P.C., EASTERN
DIAGNOSTIC AND IMAGING, INC.,
HERSH DEUTSCH, ALLEN LICHT, EDWARD
KANNER, D.C., POLINA SHIKHVARG, EFIM
ITIN, M.D.,

Defendants.

CIVIL ACTION NO. 03-969

ORDER

AND NOW, this 18th day of May, 2005, upon consideration of Plaintiffs' Motion to Quash Subpoena and For Protective Order of Subpoena Issued to National Insurance Crime Bureau by Defendant Allen Licht (Docket No. 278), Defendant Allen Licht's response thereto (Docket No. 294) and Plaintiffs' reply (Docket No. 309), it is hereby **ORDERED** that Plaintiffs' motion is **GRANTED IN PART** and **DENIED IN PART**.

Plaintiffs' Motion to Quash is **DENIED** with regard to the documents requested under number one in the Rider.¹ Specifically, National Insurance Crime Bureau is hereby **ORDERED**

¹The subpoena issued to Nationwide Insurance Company by Allen Licht requests the following information in the first paragraph of the Rider:

Records of any submissions concerning investigations, as well as any and all records and/or documents including, but not limited to meetings, collaborations, discussions, planning sessions, telephone conversations, and e-mails, between

to provide to Defendant Allen Licht copies of all documents previously produced in response to the subpoena issued by Defendant Edward Kanner, as well as any additional documents in its possession with reference Defendant Allen Licht or Eastern Diagnostic Imaging.

Plaintiffs' motion to quash is **GRANTED** with regard to the information requested under number two on the Rider.² This Court finds that Defendant Allen Licht has failed to meet his burden of presenting information to the Court which demonstrates how the requested information is relevant to the current matter.

BY THE COURT:

RONALD L. BUCKWALTER, S.J.

investigators of NICB with that of the following company [sic] during the following years as applicable to the following: Metropolitan Family Practice; Metropolitan Healthcare Center, (Inc. or PC); Eastern Diagnostic and Imaging, Inc.; Hersh Deutsch; Allen Licht; Edward Kanner, DC; Polina Shikhvarg; Efim Itin, MD; or any individual treated at or by abovementioned entities or individuals. The records should include: Place and form of meeting (formal meeting, telephone conference, video conference, informal discussion); Names of attending Individuals; Issues discussed; Actions taken.
(Pls.' Mot. to Quash, Exh. B.)

²The subpoena issued to Nationwide Insurance Company by Allen Licht requests the following information in the second paragraph of the Rider:

List and amounts of financial contributions received from below listed Companies during the below listed years. Identify: Dates of Contribution; Amount of Contribution.
(Pls.' Mot. to Quash, Exh. B.)